

**Theorem 4.19.** *A set  $E$  in a metric space is closed  $\Leftrightarrow$  every converging sequence of points in  $E$  converges to a point in  $E$ .*

*Proof.* ( $\Rightarrow$ ): Let  $E$  be closed. We must show that if  $x_n \rightarrow x$  with  $x_n \in E$ , then  $x \in E$ . For a proof by contradiction, suppose otherwise that there is some sequence  $x_n \in E$  that converges to a limit  $x \notin E$ . Then  $x \in E^c$  where  $E^c$  is open. Hence, there is an  $\varepsilon > 0$  with  $B(x, \varepsilon) \subset E^c$ . However, since  $x_n \rightarrow x$ , for large  $n$   $x_n \in B(x, \varepsilon) \subset E^c$ . For these  $n$ ,  $x_n \in E^c$  and  $x_n \in E$ , which is a contradiction.

( $\Leftarrow$ ): Suppose that every converging sequence from  $E$  has its limit in  $E$ . We must prove that  $E$  is closed. For a proof by contradiction, suppose otherwise that  $E$  is not closed. Then  $E^c$  is not open. Hence, there is an  $x \in E^c$  such that there is no open ball about  $x$  contained in  $E^c$ . This implies that for each open ball of the form  $B(x, 1/n)$ ,  $B(x, 1/n) \not\subset E^c$ ; i.e., there is an  $x_n \in B(x, 1/n) \cap E$ . In other words,  $x_n \in E$  and  $\rho(x_n, x) < 1/n \rightarrow 0$ ; i.e.,  $x_n$  is a sequence in  $E$  that converges to a point  $x \notin E$ . This contradicts the original assumption that every converging sequence from  $E$  has its limit in  $E$ .  $\square$

**Theorem 4.20** (Approximation). *Given  $x \in \bar{E}$ , either  $x \in E$ , or if  $x \notin E$ , we can approximate  $x$  by some  $y \in E$ . More precisely, given  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there is a  $y \in E$  with  $\rho(x, y) < \varepsilon$ . Hence, by taking  $\varepsilon = 1/n$ , there is an  $x_n \in E$  with  $\rho(x_n, x) < 1/n$ . In other words, there is a sequence from  $E$  that converges to  $x$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $x \in \bar{E}$  with  $x \notin E$ . We need to show that for every  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there is a  $y \in E$  with  $y \in B(x, \varepsilon)$ . Suppose otherwise that this is not the case. Then for some  $\varepsilon > 0$ ,  $B(x, \varepsilon) \cap E = \emptyset$ . Equivalently,  $E \subset B(x, \varepsilon)^c$ , which is a closed set. Hence,

$$x \in \bar{E} = \bigcap_{\substack{C: E \subset C \text{ and} \\ C \text{ is closed}}} C \subset B(x, \varepsilon)^c.$$

Of course,  $x \in B(x, \varepsilon)^c$  is a contradiction.  $\square$